across space and time, showing how South Africans and African Americans have fused supposedly contrary philosophies for well over a century. Suffrage struggles, for example, expressed a desire to participate equally with whites but also to preserve blacks' distinctive heritage. The same "integrationist nationalism" marked nearly every other black movement, including Communist efforts in both countries as well as "populist" organizations such as Garvey's Universal Negro Improvement Association and Kadalie's Industrial and Commercial Workers' Union. Even Farrakhan has occasionally implored blacks to work in tandem with sympathetic whites, especially at the polls.

Still, Fredrickson's own data suggest that the ideological connections between South African and American blacks might be somewhat weaker than he initially claims. Although South Africans closely followed Garvey and especially Washington (a symbol, in Africa, of black achievement rather than accommodation), they displayed only sporadic interest in the struggles of King and others after World War II. Most recently, Fredrickson notes, South African blacks have embraced a multiracial polity, while African Americans seem increasingly prone to "go it alone." Joining a chorus of white liberals (including myself), Fredrickson bemoans American blacks' loss of faith in King's "beloved community." But he does not explain it. Rather weakly, I think, he suggests that South Africans should learn from America that equal political rights will not redress race-based social and economic disadvantage, while African Americans should substitute a South African "nonracialism" for their prevailing "identity politics." Yet surely he must recognize that American "identity politics" is itself centered (some would say fixated) upon compensating for race-based disadvantage.

Strangely, meanwhile, this otherwise exhaustive book ignores *electoral* politics. To be fair, broad multiracial elections in South Africa have only just begun. In the United States, by contrast, they are now over three decades old. Thanks to the civil rights revolution, millions of new black voters have gone to the polls. But so have whites, who are currently in the throes of a much-ballyhooed "backlash" against black demands. To help us understand the sources of black frustration, then, Fredrickson may have to update *White Supremacy* (1981), his brilliant comparison of white ideologies in South Africa and the United States. Indeed, we might hope that his next book—like his ideal society—brings the races together. Synthesis is Fredrickson's great strength, so he might as well aim for a grand one.

Jonathan Zimmerman
New York University
New York, New York

Songs of Zion: The African Methodist Episcopal Church in the United States and South Africa. By James T. Campbell. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1995. xviii, 418 pp. $55.00, ISBN 0-19-507892-6.)

James T. Campbell's *Songs of Zion* contributes to a new impulse in comparative history, uncovering the myriad linkages between societies that help shape comparisons. Campbell's focus is the connection between the African Methodist Episcopal (AME) Church in the United States and the Ethiopian Church in South Africa. Aware that historians have "paid insufficient attention to Africa's pervasiveness in African American intellectual and imaginative life," Campbell undertakes "a study of transplantation, showing how a creed devised by and for African Americans was appropriated and transformed in a variety of South African contexts."

The work is divided into three parts, each prodigiously researched, well crafted, and insightful. The first covers the establishment and spread of African Methodism in the United States, the growing interest in missionary enterprises in the American South and abroad, and the preoccupation with Africa as a site for emigration, colonization, and missionary work. The second focuses on Ethiopianism in South Africa, the forging of a relationship with the AME Church after 1896, and the development of a "populist" social movement around the congregations that "sprouted" from Cape Town to Barotseland. The final section describes the building of a religious institution in the early twentieth century, the redirection away from political engagement

toward the establishment of the same bureaucratic structures on which the American church depended.

While the work's underlying approach to comparative history and each of its sections are sufficiently compelling to draw the attention of a wide range of scholars, the whole seems less than the sum of its parts. According to Campbell, the coming together of the two churches "began one of the most remarkable episodes in the intertwined history of Africa and black America." Between 1896 and 1910, "African Methodism exploded across the subcontinent." Such claims justify the book's recounting of the early history of the AME Church, as if African Methodism provided the necessary seed or spark for the African social movement. The evidence from the book, however, suggests that the author perhaps exaggerates African Methodist influence. The vital middle section blurs African Methodism and Ethiopianism. But within three years of joining the AME Church, leading members of the Ethiopian Church had defected (other defections followed in 1904 and 1908), taking many of the forty thousand Africans who had joined the AME Church, the core of the social movement, with them. From 1900 on, such African Methodists as Levi J. Coppin knew that they were not leading a populist movement, realized that they faced a membership crisis, and still tried to separate themselves from any hint of Ethiopianism. While Campbell describes such developments in his last section, they surely have profound implications for the "social movement" he describes in the second.

If, as Campbell suggests, "for a brief historical moment, this venerable African American institution stood at the center of one of the most dynamic popular movements in Africa," this was something that its American members learned of after the fact and that they labored to rectify. Whether or not the Ethiopian Church could have spread as rapidly as it did without the AME connection, it was Ethiopian "populism"—not an "appropriation" of Richard Allen's vision of uplift and respectability—that seems to have spawned this social movement.

Robert Gregg
Richard Stockton College
Pomona, New Jersey

Camp on Custer: Transcribing the Custer Myth. Ed. by Bruce R. Liddic and Paul Harbaugh. (Spokane: Clark, 1995. 189 pp. $75.00, ISBN 0-87062-230-7.)

Few episodes in the history of the American West have received so much attention as the Sioux Indian massacre of George Armstrong Custer's Seventh United States Cavalry Regiment troops at the Little Big Horn on June 25, 1876. In about June 1908, Walter Camp, educated as an engineer, undertook the task of finding and interviewing surviving participants in the Big Horn battle. Camp recorded what he was told on each occasion, making notes with a pencil, often on whatever paper scrap might come to hand. Camp said that he alone would understand his notes and that he would use them for a definitive history of the Indian wars. At Camp's death in 1925, his papers remained in the possession of his widow; only after long haggling did she begin to transfer them to a private collector in June 1933.

Some of Camp's manuscripts are in the libraries of Indiana University, Brigham Young University, and the Denver Public Library. Other papers were in a private collection that Bruce R. Liddic first saw in 1991. With assistance from coauthor Paul Harbaugh, Liddic spent more than a year sorting through the interviews, putting them into some sequence, and annotating them. *Camp on Custer* comprises individual recollections by military and Indian survivors of their own individual experiences. The editors have provided footnoted data on each serviceman, information drawn from service records on file.

While *Camp on Custer* will be of most interest to Indian war buffs, there are generalizations apparent for more casual readers. We learn that the always-flamboyant Custer liked to have his regimental mounted bandsmen play the regimental march "Garry Owen" when troops assaulted Sioux villages. And troop talk frequently mentioned that Custer was so incautious that he would run into trouble sooner or later. The Sioux at Big Horn did not know they had killed Custer; in preparing for the campaign, he had cut short his blowing hair and wore an ordinary blue officer's uniform. From the service records it